Perth Freight Link: Making the Right Investment in Perth’s Freight Task

by

Peter Newman
CUSP, Curtin University
Perth Freight Link: Making the right Investment In Perth’s Freight Task

A position paper for the City of Fremantle by:
Peter Newman and Cole Hendrigan
Curtin University Sustainability Policy (CUSP) Institute

June 8, 2015

www.fremantle.wa.gov.au
Questions...

1. Why is there a PFL being built?
2. What kind of Freight Strategy was being developed before the PFL?
3. If PFL to Inner Harbour is built what will happen?
4. Will it work?
5. The economics?
6. The alternatives?
7. What does privatization mean for the PFL?
Why is there a PFL being built?

1. To increase the speed of trucks going to the port (especially container trucks).

2. To try and avoid having trucks go through the City of Melville and the seat of Riverton. Election commitments.

3. To spend Federal money dropped on the WA Government as part of the $40b promised Roads of 21st Century spending. ‘Urban rail is not in our knitting’
National context...

- IA encouraged states to recycle assets like ports in order to build needed infrastructure.
- NSW sold Port of Botany for $5.0b and they recycled $4.3b back into 3 Sydney rail projects that ALP could never do. Very popular...all good BCR’s.
- Freight *can’t* do good BCR’s by itself. Needs cars...
- ‘Roads of 21st century’....West Connex $12b, East-West Link $10b and Perth Freight Link $2b dropped from the sky...all in trouble.
PERTH FREIGHT LINK - CURRENT PROJECT CONCEPT
Section Two to be confirmed later in 2015

Figure 9. Image of proposed PFL from WA Main Roads May 2016 “Perth Freight Link A Free Flowing Freight Connection” available at https://www.mainroads.wa.gov.au/Documents/Perth%20Freight%20Link-Information%20Sheet%20April%202015-web.RCN-D5%5E23197747.PDF

Figure 10. The PFL avoiding the City of Melville and some sensitive state seats instead of running directly to the port down Leach Highway. Why would a heavy goods truck take a longer tolled route? Source: Perth Freight Link, Business Case Executive Summary
Sydney’s global city has shifted port Centres New Rail
Melbourne’s plan for growth in people and freight....
What kind of Freight Strategy was being developed before the PFL?

- Shifting to more use of rail. Presently 14%, goal 30%
- Improving truck management.
- Preparing to shift to Outer Harbour when Inner Harbour limits are reached.

BIPARTISAN APPROACH
‘Fremantle Port’s Inner Harbour container trade is expected to reach optimal capacity within the next 10 to 15 years’

FPA, Annual Report, 2013/14
‘Optimal capacity’ of moving containers on and off ships
Not optimal for transport now....

Increasing the use of rail for container freight is a key strategy to increase efficiency and reduce truck traffic impacts on community.

Redesign of roads within and linking with Rous Head has improved truck flows.
Trucks already over the limit for a city location.

Rail getting better but not winning...
Community support for road to rail...

FPA survey
Figure 8: Indicative scenario for the Inner and Outer Harbour transitioning arrangements, Perth Freight Plan ‘Business Case’, Dec 2014

7 years from now...just after PFL opens at end 2019!
Even most recent Perth planning document focuses on Outer Harbour and several inland ports for rail handling.
Old Outer Harbour proposal
More sensible proposal
If PFL to Inner Harbour is built what will happen?

1. The number of trucks going to and from the Inner Harbour will increase more rapidly than before. Up to 4 times, from 3000 per day to 12-13,000 per day, by 2050 if rail closes and present trends continue.

2. The limits on the Inner Harbour will be reached in 5-10 years with no other alternative site being ready. The Outer Harbour needs to begin now with the PFL going there.
Preferred scenario: Cap and Transition

Most likely scenario: No Outer Harbour, No Rail
The impacts are huge....

- Fremantle will not be able to grow as an economic activity centre based on its knowledge/services. No city centre can be a liveable, walkable investment opportunity if it is besieged by trucks.

- The impacts on the suburbs and wetlands will be a legacy that lasts generations. Beeliar; D’Orsogna; noise/diesel pollution; access across the cuttings; North and East Fremantle – will never be the same.

- The planned freight facilities at Kwinana, Latitude 32 and associated areas, will be stunted.
The Freight Links Highways upgrades have these costly flow-on effects:

- Stirling Bridge doubled & Stock, Leach, Stirling and Tydeman widened at great cost.
- Heavy metals and fine to ultra fine diesel exhaust particulates in the air.
- Rail-line ROW sub-optimisation as more freight will be moved by heavy truck.
- Money spent on inducing yet more vehicle traffic rather than carbon-free transport.
- Decreased urban redevelopment activity due to Port buffer restrictions.
- Decreased walkability across neighbourhoods.
- All at great direct and indirect cost for a Freight Link which could be better directed to a long term new 'Outer Harbour' Port.

Figure 11. The PFL as proposed with all of its associated problems: bridges, tunnels, diesel particulates, undercuts rail, less money for public transport, limits good urban growth among other.
Environmental impacts...
Urban impacts...
Urban impacts
Highly Unwalkable Environment
High Speed Turning Radius
Dollars Spent over Public Transit

Sound Wall
Air Quality Decrease
Stirling Bridge Doubled
Figure 13. The new proposal for the High/Leach and Stirling Intersection. Leach is lowered into an open trench to slide under Camlington, High and Marmion Street.

Figure 14. The new proposal for Leach Highway at the Golf Course. At this point the trench is 30 meters deep.

Figure 15. The new proposal for Stirling Highway as it passes under Marmion Street. At this point it is 6.5 meters deep.
‘The location of a container port right in the middle of suburbia is the chief problem, Anything you do will be a short lived band aid and there will always be somebody with reduced amenity due to trucks on roads.’

Harry M, Perth Now website
‘New freeways are like poisonous rivers. You can’t live next to them, you can’t walk alongside them – and they don’t solve congestion problems they are meant to fix. It is so weird that you in Perth continue to build new roads and new freeways when the rest of the developed world has stopped.’

Enrique Penelosa, former Mayor of Bogota, The West Australian, April 16th.